



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



ALFRED E. ALQUIST
SEISMIC SAFETY COMMISSION MEETING
In-person and Teleconference Meeting
Thursday, April 11, 2024

I. Call to Order

Chair Silva called the meeting to order at approximately 9:05 am.

II. Chair Remarks

Dr. Miyamoto provided an update on the 7.6 magnitude earthquake that struck Japan's Noto Peninsula on January 1st.

III. Roll Call

Tanya Black conducted the roll call. The following table provides information on each Commissioner's and Representative's attendance status.

Commissioner	In-Person	Virtual	Absent
Cindy Silva, Chair, Local Government	X		
Representative Allison Kustic for Assemblymember Rodriguez, Vice Chair, California (CA) Assembly Member	X		
Representative Astghik Hakobyan for Senator Portantino, CA Senate Member		X	
Ida Clair, CA Division of State Architect	X		
Alegría De La Cruz, Social Services		X	
Debra Games, Local Government	X		
Representative Lori Nezhura for Nancy Ward, CA Governor's Office of Emergency Services (Cal OES)	X		
Joone Kim-Lopez, Public Utility		X	
Irina Brauzman, Building Standards Commission	X		
Kevin McGowan, Emergency Services		X	
David Rabbitt, Local Government	X		
Vincent Wells, Fire Protection	X		
Dr. H. Kit Miyamoto, Structural Engineer		X	
Total Attendance:	8	5	0



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



IV. Public Comment: Items on Agenda

Chair Silva opened public comment for items on the agenda. There were no public comments.

V. Approval of SSC January 11, 2024, Meeting Minutes:

Commissioner Garnes made a motion, which was seconded by Commission Clair. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion to approve the amended January 11, 2024, Meeting Minutes passed unanimously. The following table provides details on the vote.

Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstained	Not Present
Cindy Silva, Chair	X			
Representative Allison Kustic	X			
Representative Astghik Hakobyan				X
Ida Clair	X			
Debra Garnes	X			
Alegría De La Cruz	X			
Representative Lori Nezhura	X			
Joone Kim-Lopez	X			
Representative Irina Brauzman	X			
Kevin McGowan	X			
Dr. H. Kit Miyamoto	X			
David Rabbitt	X			
Vincent Wells	X			
Total Votes:	12	0	0	1



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



VI. Building Resilient Infrastructure and Communities (BRIC) 2023 Cal OES Seismic Safety Commission (SSC) Building Code Plus Up **Speaker Annde Ewertsen, Executive Director, SSC**

Executive Director Ewertsen provided an update on the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) Building Resilient Infrastructure and Communities (BRIC) 2023 grant sub-application. The BRIC s Building Code Plus Up sub-application aims to assess current code provisions' effectiveness in meeting mobile home seismic safety standards. Due to an expanded geotechnical scope and higher costs for testing, the grant request increased from \$300,000 to \$450,000. Director Ewertsen sought approval to proceed with the \$450,000 grant, maintaining the 25% local match fulfilled through staff time.

Director Ewertsen explained the \$450,000 sub-application was submitted one week following the previous meeting, providing the option to adjust the amount downward later, if necessary.

Discussion:

Chair Silva confirmed the 25% cost share requirement would be met through staff time. Commissioner Rabbitt asked whether the increased geotechnical scope, which includes testing different soil types, was responsible for the added expenses. Director Ewertsen confirmed and added that higher testing bids also contributed to the increased cost.

Commissioner Garnes made a motion, which was seconded by Commission De La Cruz. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion to approve the increase of the BRIC 2023 Cal OES SSC Building Code Plus Up sub-application to \$450,000 passed unanimously.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstained	Not Present
Cindy Silva, Chair	X			
Representative Allison Kustic	X			
Representative Astghik Hakobyan				X
Ida Clair	X			
Debra Garnes	X			
Alegría De La Cruz	X			
Representative Lori Nezhura	X			
Joone Kim-Lopez	X			
Representative Irina Brauzman	X			
Kevin McGowan	X			
Dr. H. Kit Miyamoto	X			
David Rabbitt	X			
Vincent Wells	X			
Total Votes:	12	0	0	1

VII. Southern California Edison Letter of Support
Speaker Annde Ewertsen, Executive Director, SSC

Executive Director Ewertsen introduced a request from Southern California Edison (SCE) for a letter of support regarding their seismic mitigation upgrades. The request was related to SCE's General Rate Change Filing for 2025-2028. While SSC does not take positions on rate filings or funding methods, a general support letter emphasizing the importance of seismic upgrades to critical infrastructure was drafted by SSC staff.

Discussion:

Commissioner Kim-Lopez expressed support for issuing the letter but sought clarification on the criteria for utility agencies requesting such letters. Each request is considered case-by-case, with the SSC focusing on general support for mitigation efforts rather than endorsing specific rate increases.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Chair Silva emphasized the importance of supporting agencies with critical infrastructure across the state, highlighting that infrastructure does not last indefinitely.

Commissioner Wells made a motion, which was seconded by Commission Rabbitt. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion to approve authorizing SSC staff to make any non-substantive edits and finalize the Letter of Support for SCE's seismic retrofitting efforts passed unanimously.

Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstained	Not Present
Cindy Silva, Chair	X			
Representative Allison Kustic	X			
Representative Astghik Hakobyan				X
Ida Clair	X			
Debra Garnes	X			
Alegría De La Cruz	X			
Representative Lori Nezhura	X			
Joone Kim-Lopez	X			
Representative Irina Brauzman	X			
Kevin McGowan	X			
Dr. H. Kit Miyamoto	X			
David Rabbitt	X			
Vincent Wells	X			
Total Votes:	12	0	0	1

VIII. Ferndale Earthquake Sequence: Understanding Impediments to Local Recovery in Rio Dell, California
Speaker Annde Ewertsen, Executive Director, SSC

Director Ewertsen proceeded to outline the six priority recommendations, noting that they were not ranked in order of importance:

1. Develop and update a local Emergency Operations Plan (EOP) and drill in coordination with the local operational area/county.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



2. Educate residents and businesses on the value of and funding sources for seismic retrofits and other earthquake mitigation activities.
3. Identify local Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) and Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) and establish a post-disaster plan.
4. Encourage FEMA to update eligibility criteria for federal assistance programs so small, rural communities that experience social vulnerability and/or economic disadvantage have equitable access to federal disaster assistance funding.
5. As a stopgap to the lack of federal assistance, work with the State to add an individual assistance funding program.
6. Support long-term disaster recovery and resilience by planning to address the post-disaster social and mental health needs.

These recommendations aim to enhance the preparedness, response, and recovery abilities of Rio Dell and similar communities in seismic-risk areas. Challenges present learning opportunities for future events, fostering a more resilient recovery process.

Discussion:

Commissioner Garnes expressed gratitude for the support and emphasized the importance of the recommendations for all communities, not just Rio Dell.

Representative Nezhura highlighted the group's comprehensive approach, with recommendations covering all levels of government and various community sectors.

Chair Silva emphasized the national scope of the problem, noting that remote or isolated communities across the country face similar challenges in meeting the minimum funding levels for all types of natural disasters.

Representative Nezhura added that the National Emergency Management Association has also raised this issue with FEMA.

Commissioner Kim-Lopez sought clarity on how the SSC could advocate for the recommendations, especially the FEMA eligibility criteria and stop-gap funding to ensure accountability.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Commissioner Rabbitt emphasized the importance of lowering the financial threshold for federal assistance, particularly given the frequency of emergencies. Challenges with the current budget process in Congress highlight the strain on local reserves during recovery periods, which can lead to financial difficulties.

The committee then addressed the procedure for submitting the report to FEMA, agreeing to revisit the topic in the next meeting.

Chair Silva made a motion, which was seconded by Commissioner Garnes. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion to direct staff to add an agenda item on the Rio Dell report for further discussion at the upcoming meeting passed unanimously.

Commissioner	Yes Vote	No Vote	Abstained
Cindy Silva, Chair	X		
Representative Allison Kustic	X		
Representative Astghik Hakobyan	X		
Ida Clair	X		
Debra Garnes	X		
Alegría De La Cruz	X		
Representative Lori Nezhura	X		
Joone Kim-Lopez	X		
Representative Irina Brauzman	X		
Kevin McGowan	X		
Dr. H. Kit Miyamoto	X		
David Rabbitt	X		
Vincent Wells	X		
Total Votes:	13	0	0

Commissioner Rabbitt made a motion, which Commission Clair seconded. A roll call vote was taken to authorize SSC staff to make any non-substantive edits, finalize, and approve the Ferndale Earthquake Sequence: Understanding Impediments to Local Recovery in Rio Dell Report, which passed unanimously.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Commissioner	Yes Vote	No Vote	Abstained
Cindy Silva, Chair	X		
Representative Allison Kustic	X		
Representative Astghik Hakobyan	X		
Ida Clair	X		
Debra Garnes	X		
Alegría De La Cruz	X		
Representative Lori Nezhura	X		
Joone Kim-Lopez	X		
Representative Irina Brauzman	X		
Kevin McGowan	X		
Dr. H. Kit Miyamoto	X		
David Rabbitt	X		
Vincent Wells	X		
Total Votes:	13	0	0

IX. Earthquakes and Climate Change Workshop
Speaker Annde Ewertsen, Executive Director, SSC

Director Ewertsen explained that the SSC is interested in arranging a workshop on earthquakes and climate change. The workshop would involve collaboration with the California Geological Survey (CGS) and the United States Geological Survey (USGS) and will explore various topics related to climate change and earthquakes. The goal is to foster multidisciplinary collaboration among experts in earthquake science, engineering, and climate science to enhance community resilience to natural disasters, align earthquake issues with California's climate goals, and improve preparedness for climate-induced hazard events. The target audience includes researchers, engineers, and government partners involved in climate and earthquake hazard research and preparedness, mitigation, and resilience planning. The online workshop is estimated to cost \$1,600.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Discussion:

Representative Kustic endorsed the event, emphasizing Vice-Chair Rodriguez's dedication to emergency preparedness, particularly in the face of multiple concurrent disasters.

Chair Silva asked about the duration and structure of the workshop. Director Ewertsen indicated it would likely last no more than two days and could feature multiple sessions.

Commissioner Kim-Lopez expressed full support for the workshop and raised the question of whether SSC commissioners could provide input about meeting topics.

Commissioner Miyamoto also voiced support for the initiative and emphasized the importance of preparing for potential cascading disasters like fires following earthquakes, especially considering climate change impacts such as drought and extreme weather events.

Commissioner Rabbitt made a motion, which was seconded by Commissioner Miyamoto. After a roll call vote, the motion to approve SSC staff to proceed with planning the Earthquakes and Climate Change Workshop passed unanimously.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstained	Not Present
Cindy Silva, Chair	X			
Representative Allison Kustic	X			
Representative Astghik Hakobyan				X
Ida Clair	X			
Debra Garnes	X			
Alegría De La Cruz	X			
Representative Lori Nezhura	X			
Joone Kim-Lopez	X			
Representative Irina Brauzman	X			
Kevin McGowan	X			
Dr. H. Kit Miyamoto	X			
David Rabbitt	X			
Vincent Wells	X			
Total Votes:	12	0	0	1

X. AB 100 Report: California State University (CSU)
Speaker Andrew Theisen, Emergency and Continuity Manager, Systemwide Emergency Management and Jack Andersen, Chief of Planning & Design, Capital Planning, Design, and Construction

Andrew Theisen shared the background of the CSU system and, specifically, the history of the Northridge earthquake's impact on the community. The CSU system engages in earthquake preparedness education, including participating in the annual Great ShakeOut, conducting drop, cover, and hold drills, and hosting earthquake awareness events like earthquake simulation trailers.

The CSU system employs a Systemwide Emergency Support Team (SWEST) that activates during regional incidents impacting multiple campuses, like major earthquakes. The SWEST facilitates coordination and supports affected Universities through virtual emergency operations centers. It collects and shares campus operational status, instructional impacts, and other relevant information. Andrew Theisen shared more details about various earthquake scenarios.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Jack Andersen discussed the CSU Seismic Review Board (SRB) and seismic policy, established in 1992 to ensure earthquake safety for students, staff, and the public.

The SRB members are tasked with responding to earthquakes and instituting protocols if measurable damage occurs. They contact three main campus contact points: university police, campus deputy building officials, and university executive facilities officers. If significant damage is identified, the SRB member assumes the Emergency Deputy Building Official (EDBO) role to objectively assess building safety. The EDBO updates the building official and determines building statuses based on assessments using ATC 20 guidelines, categorizing them as red, yellow, or green tagged. University administrators cannot overrule the authority of the EDBO or the building official during such events. Seismic upgrades and improvements have been conducted on several buildings, including the Cal Poly Humboldt Theater Arts Building, the Cal Poly Humboldt Library, the Stanislaus State Library, and the CSU East Bay Library Annex.

Discussion:

Chair Silva inquired why the SRB had only been activated during the Northridge earthquake and no other seismic events.

Jack Andersen clarified that while the full protocol with the appointment of the EDBO was only implemented during the Northridge quake, SRB members had been deployed for assessments during incidents like the Lawndale earthquake and the "hurriquake".

Chair Silva inquired about student displacement resulting from damage to off-campus housing in seismic events.

Andrew Theisen explained they would consider community impacts, utilizing mutual aid systems to support displaced students through other campuses or external agency partners.

Representative Kustic asked about the selection process for assigning structural engineers to specific campuses within the CSU system. Jack Andersen explained that engineers are allocated across different regions throughout the state. While rotations are rare, engineers visit their assigned



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



campuses at least once or twice a year to maintain consistency and build institutional knowledge, which is a significant benefit to the program.

XI. AB 100 Report: University of California

Speaker Lauren Friedman, AIA, Executive Director Capital Asset Strategies University of California (UC), Office of the President and Ellen Owens, AIA, Director, Design and Construction Services University of California, Office of the President

Lauren Friedman and Ellen Owens provided an overview of the UC seismic program. Ellen Owens discussed the UC's extensive property holdings, including campuses, health centers, and laboratories, and highlighted the proactive approach taken to ensure earthquake safety. Notable updates, such as the adoption of a 2030 deadline for seismic remediation and the establishment of a seismic advisory board, were discussed. Additionally, seismic assessments for over 6,000 owned buildings were completed in January 2021, with approximately 70% deemed compliant with the policy.

Laura Friedman shared findings after the assessment of the UC-owned space.

Ellen Owens reported non-compliance rates over three years, improvements made through building retrofits, and future plans.

Lauren Friedman concluded the presentation by discussing ongoing challenges in meeting the UC seismic safety policy's 2030 compliance deadline due to funding limitations. Consequently, there's a current initiative to revise the policy, focusing on continual improvement rather than a single deadline. Funding options, such as Governor's Office Bonds, are being pursued, emphasizing prioritizing projects that fulfill multiple campus objectives.

Discussion:

Chair Silva inquired about the UC Seismic Advisory Board and its comparison to the Pacific Earthquake Engineering Research (PEER) Review Board in the Cal State University system.

Lauren Friedman clarified that the UC board serves as an advisory body, unlike CSU's more involved peer review system. The UC board meets



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



quarterly and advises on policy and methods for assessing buildings for seismic risk. They collaborate on recommendations for campus projects, such as implementing ground motion analyses and nonstructural hazard mitigation programs.

Commissioner Rabbitt raised questions about extending the 2030 deadline for seismic compliance and whether the criteria for prioritization would change.

Laura Friedman clarified that while the criteria remain the same, the approach shifts towards an incremental improvement model. The goal is to maintain pressure on campuses while alleviating the anxiety of meeting a fixed deadline.

Chair Silva directed that the following agenda item, 11 UCSD Shake Table, be taken up at the end of the meeting.

XII. Project Updates

Speaker Annde Ewertsen, Executive Director, SSC

A. Ferndale & Türkiye

Director Ewertsen provided an update on the project, highlighting its three components.

1. The Ferndale Earthquake Sequence Report was approved during the meeting.
2. The scenario study examines -triggered earthquake events in Northern and Southern California. Specific magnitudes and fault triggers were outlined for each region. Collaboration with PEER, USGS, and Cal OES was emphasized in this phase. Volume one of the scenario study will be presented to SSC on July 18, 2024, followed by volume two on October 10, 2024.
3. The study, focused on resilience and recovery project scenarios under the IN-CORE contract, awaits the Department of General Services' (DGS) approval.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



B. Fire Station Inventory

Director Ewertsen discussed the Fire Station Inventory Project. The goal is to finish the report, update FEMA HAZUS data by fall 2024, and develop recommendations and action plans with partner groups.

C. Northridge Anniversary – Quake Heroes

Although the Quake Heroes Project was approved last year, there have been delays in securing contract approval. The submission to the Department of Governmental Services (DGS) requires additional details, potentially prolonging the process by 6-8 months.

XIII. Misc. Announcements

Speaker Annde Ewertsen, Executive Director, SSC

Director Ewertsen shared miscellaneous updates, including the upcoming delivery of Commissioner Resource Binders and a poll regarding the SSC meeting start time. Director Ewertsen concluded by expressing gratitude to Chair Silva for her significant contributions to the commission, including her involvement in various ad-hoc committees and support in important initiatives like the Rio Dell report.

XIV. Chair and Vice-Chair Election

Director Ewertsen provided an overview of the Chair and Vice Chair's election process. Candidates were required to submit a Statement of Qualifications (SOQ) by the end of March. The candidates are given a 3-minute opportunity to address the SSC and answer one question from each commissioner. The newly elected officers will assume their duties immediately following the vote.

The Vice-Chair position had only one candidate, Commissioner Garnes, who opted not to speak.

Chair Silva made a motion, which was seconded by Commissioner Wells. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion to elect Commissioner Garnes as Vice Chair for 2024-25 passed unanimously.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstained	Not Present
Cindy Silva, Chair	X			
Representative Allison Kustic	X			
Representative Astghik Hakobyan	X			
Ida Clair	X			
Debra Garnes	X			
Alegría De La Cruz	X			
Representative Lori Nezhura	X			
Joone Kim-Lopez	X			
Representative Irina Brauzman	X			
Kevin McGowan	X			
Dr. H. Kit Miyamoto				X
David Rabbitt	X			
Vincent Wells	X			
Total Votes:	12	0	0	1

Commissioner Rabbitt and Commissioner Rodriguez submitted SOQs for the chair position. Both candidates took the opportunity to speak.

Commissioners were given the chance to ask each candidate a single question. The candidates rotated the order of their responses, ensuring that each had an equal opportunity to speak first.

A roll-call vote was taken, and Commissioner Rabbitt was elected as the new Chair.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Commissioner	Rodriguez	Rabbitt	Abstained	Not Present
Cindy Silva, Chair		X		
Representative Allison Kustic	X			
Representative Astghik Hakobyan			X	
Ida Clair		X		
Debra Garnes		X		
Alegría De La Cruz	X			
Representative Lori Nezhura		X		
Joone Kim-Lopez	X			
Representative Irina Brauzman		X		
Kevin McGowan		X		
Dr. H. Kit Miyamoto				X
David Rabbitt		X		
Vincent Wells		X		
Total Votes:	3	8	1	1

XV. UCSD Shake Table Update

Speaker Tara C. Hutchinson, P.E., Ph.D., University of California, San Diego

Dr. Tara C. Hutchinson provided an update on their ongoing research project.

Chair Silva sought clarification on the schedule for seismic testing and live fire scenarios. Dr. Hutchinson responded that the projection for seismic testing is tentatively set for April 2025. She explained that after seismic testing, preparations for live fire testing would involve removing seismic sensors and cabling and installing instrumentation for fire testing, extending into May and June 2025.

Chair Silva asked if the public could observe the testing. Dr. Hutchinson stated they would organize partner days for observation. She explained they had initially reserved six weeks for seismic tests without public access, followed by low-level shaking tests for interested parties. They planned to start from the top and work down for the fire test, adjusting as needed. Dr. Hutchinson emphasized the need for flexibility in allowing observers to join at various stages of the program.



Cal OES
GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
OF EMERGENCY SERVICES



Chair Rabbitt inquired about the impact of analyzing three different construction types and whether finished materials would be used in the fire test or if the focus was solely on the structural integrity post-earthquake.

Dr. Hutchinson addressed Chair Rabbitt's second question first, explaining that the specimen was designed to emulate a slice of a larger building, with finished materials on both the exterior and interior faces. She clarified that the fire test would evaluate the entire structure, encompassing both finished and structural components.

XVI. Public Comment: Not on Agenda

There were no public comments submitted for items not on the agenda.

XVII. Adjourn

Chair Rabbitt adjourned the meeting at 12:08 pm.

To view the full meeting recording, please visit the following link:
<https://youtu.be/0ggFWw4qHDE?si=NnMdhBOnNQolo-YA>